

Conceptual framework of inclusive economies - Colombia

Date:10 August 2017

Hour:7:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.

Place:Lounge El Mirador, Pontificia Universidad Javeriana

Welcome and contextualization

Monica Villegas opens the event mentioning the participation of the Rockefeller Foundation and USC Dornsife researchers and UC Santa Cruz through the Everett program. Which they have been designed inclusive economies from an integral vision that is 5 Key dimensions for the realization of it, then, with the aim of establishing a multidimensional framework to understand and promote economies of its kind in different countries, has it developed the first process through which seeks to make a comparative analysis between Colombia, South Africa and India.

In the case of Colombia, there has been a focus analysis of urban contexts studying cases of Bogota, Medellin and Cali in partnership with the Network of Cities How Come.

Inclusive economies: Colombia

Manuel Pastor - Director, USC Program for Environmental and Regional Equity (PERE)

Gabriela Giusta - Research Specialist, UCSC Everett Program

The University of Southern California develops work on economic issues, taking into account issues such as environmental and social conditions faced by low-income communities in urban areas and social movements that attempt to change those realities.

On the other hand, the Everett Program directed by Chris Benner, is guiding approach urban political ecology and conducts research seeking to understand the relationship between technological change, urban development, regional development and economic opportunity structures.

The three main conclusions of the study, have shown that inclusive economies are possible and may work better. That is, that equity works and can produce benefits for all in motivational and social terms (1. inclusive economies are possible and may work better).

an opportunity is in building epistemic communities in which everyone shared from their capacity to cross-sectoral discussions to allow a dialogue between knowledge (2. What helps this happen in metropolitan areas of the United States, are knowledge communities and intersectoral discussions).

Finally, it is essential to have data for discussion (Draft data and indicators are not addressed only to measure change but are tools to promote these conversations).

According to the Rockefeller Foundation, inclusive economy expands opportunities for shared prosperity, especially for those who face greater barriers to advance their socio-economic well-being. It has five dimensions that are growth, equity, participation, sustainability and stability.

Then it made a first approach to more than 30 initiatives through which global indicators were identified for a better understanding of the theories of change and to inquire about how inclusive economies related concepts are being measured in the world.

In a second time, it has tried to carry out a comparative process between cases and subnational aspects, so that a productive conversation for the future. The three selected cases were South Africa for its racial status and dynamics involved, India for its large economy where poverty gap is wide and where interest between urban and rural and Colombia is evident because it has the rate of inequality highest in Latin America and because intentions of inclusive economies that are not entirely successful, also is an opportunity comparability of cities through the Network of cities How Come are evident.

Five dimensions of inclusive economies

The authors took the five dimensions for the Rockefeller Foundation involves inclusive economy and constituted from these nine subindexes that in turn contain different categories and aspects to consider.

I. Equitativa

More opportunities are available to allow upward mobility for more people. All segments of society, especially the poor and socially disadvantaged groups, can take advantage of these opportunities.

Inequality is declining rather than increasing. People have equal access to a stronger economic base, including equal access to goods and services and adequate infrastructure, such as public transport, education, clean air and water.

A. *Upward Mobility for all*

- Intergenerational mobility in education
- Intergenerational mobility in earnings
- Income mobility over the life of a person
- Opportunity childhood education

B. *Reducing inequality*

- relative poverty
- Concentration of funds in the highest stratum
- Gender equality

C. *Equal access to public goods and ecosystem services*

- Access to safe water and sanitation
- Access to electricity
- Access to education and health of children
- Access to public transport

II. participatory

People are able to participate fully in economic life and have a greater say about their future. People can access and participate in markets as workers, consumers and business owners. Transparency around the common knowledge of the rules and standards allows people to start a business, find a job or participate in markets. Technology is widely distributed and promotes greater individual and community well-being.

D. *People can access and participate in markets as workers, consumers and business owners*

- formal and informal employment
- Business development
- Household consumption

E. *Market transparency and symmetry of information*

- Ease of Doing Business
- Freedom of expression and association
- Government power and corruption

F. *Widespread adoption of technology*

- Access to telecommunication devices
- Internet access

III. Growing

An economy that produces more and more goods and services to allow big profits, greater prosperity and better opportunities. Good work and job opportunities grow, and revenues continue to increase especially for the poor. Economic systems are transformed for the benefit of everyone, including and especially poor and excluded communities. Economic growth and economic transformation are not only captured by aggregate measures of economic output (eg GDP), but also include other indicators of well-being.

G. *Increase good work and job opportunity*

- Access to decent employment
- Variation in per capita income
- absolute poverty

H. *Improve the material well-being*

- Per capita income
- Nutrition and health
- living place

I. *Economic transformation for the benefit of all*

- Effectiveness of workforce
- Domestic investment in innovation
- global market position innovation

IV. Sustainable

Economic and social wealth is sustainable over time, thus maintaining intergenerational prosperity. In the case of natural capital, inclusive economies preserves or restores the ecological capacity to produce goods and ecosystem services that contribute to human well-being, where decision-making is not only incorporates earnings base use full resources short term, but also adds costs and long-term benefits.

J. *The social and economic welfare is increasingly sustainable*

- Changes in nutrition levels
- Changes in household infrastructure
- Changes in levels of health

K. *Increased investment in environmental health and less use of natural resources*

- Optimum energy consumption
- Water consumption and water quality
- Air pollution
- Conservation of natural resources

L. *The decision-making processes incorporate long-term costs*

- Sustainable production and consumption of materials

V. Stable

People, communities, businesses and governments have a sufficient degree of confidence in the future and a greater ability to predict the results of economic decisions. Individuals, households, communities and businesses have enough to invest in their future security. Economic systems are extremely resistant to shocks and stresses, especially to shocks that impact disproportionately poor or vulnerable communities.

M. public and private confidence in the future and the ability to predict economic performance

- Variability of per capita GDP
- Government policies and regulations solid

N. Members of society can invest in your future

- Unbanked
- Protection of property rights
- political unrest and civil disobedience

O. economic resilience to shocks and strains

- social security and public programs government
- Diversification of exports
- macroeconomic stability
- Emergency preparedness

Key points of Colombia

- o Race is a key concept in studies of exclusion, however, race few indicators are in Colombia.
 - o Cities perform better than rural areas. It is also important to understand patterns of inclusion in rural areas.
 - o Longitudinal studies complement traditional data, as explained more clearly inclusion patterns over time.
- **Comparative analysis between the three countries studied**
- o In India we attempt to show what is the variation of indicators
 - o In South Africa migration analyzes
1. When studies are done at the community level people give much value to the stability, ie, a stable income and a stable life are better than the constant changes. However, close attention to the variability is not given and how changes occur such income.
 2. much attention paid to sustainability, but the indicators are not fully developed, just working on issues such as economy and environment are set aside.
 3. much variability in the way that data between countries and within them are gathered in cities is evident. Variability of how to measure data difficult to compare conditions (Harmonize is a challenge).
 4. It is not always clear in each case, how is data collection linked with the theory of change. measurement of indicators is not connected with the promotion of an inclusive economy.
 5. much interest is in the development opportunity botom-up but the indicators are up - down, ie technicians are what make indicators and measured. It is therefore important that communities also raise indicators and how to measure them.
 6. Consultation is different from the participation of the population, ie should be given participation in the selection of indicators.

7. When thinking of a city, you think about the government and what can be done to improve the conditions of the population. However, one can not ignore the fact that cities are a system with private companies, social movements, etc. Where different actors influencing converge.
8. In terms of scale there are 3 important dimensions:
Cities must think of (regional) metropolitan term ie the city beyond itself because it connects systems.
It should be visible small programs economies of scale and should be included in these large companies to scale those small pilot projects.
Indicators should transcend measure the effectiveness of policies in terms of results and policies.
9. This is a long term process that requires several years (20 -30) which must be clarified incentives to maintain the direction towards inclusive economy.
10. It is not just measure what's happening but consider indicators involved in change processes to promote the action of people towards an inclusive economy, which is beyond data collection but an idea of materialisation of change.

Questions From Readers

1. Manuel Riaño

Open the discussion by saying that this is a proposal that is repetitive and is productive for the country. also he mentioned that Colombia has become a pilot urban studies from different organizations, which becomes an opportunity for the prospects of the national vision of the country.

1.1

An innovative element to note is generational mobility, because of the importance of the temporal transcendence and present analysis on these issues in the future.

It also highlights the perspective of equality of women because it is not visible in other studies element. Notes that despite improvements in certain economic factors are evident, remains marked gap in the country that remains static, ergo, it can be questioned whether there is a relationship versus not address equity in terms of attention to poverty is problematic .

1.2

Intergenerational mobility is not currently measured, but is technically challenging think how to move towards measuring these elements. Evidence an opportunity to strengthen indicators such as average income and this could be done with the income quintiles of EIH to obtain an approach in this indicator.

He also mentions that the battery of indicators that show the researchers, must be secured in the city as there are indicators that can be improved or be more accurate.

1.3

The country has weighed the battery indicators Monetary Poverty Index and Multidimensional Poverty. The study indicators that are there and to be joined in this new theoretical framework to see how they think the challenges of shortages of the city, invite identify who is responsible for what is presented, "who and what?". It could be striking land the experiment at an intermediate city.

1.4

Colombia contributes to the study of inclusive economy an opportunity to deepen the study in terms of spatial segregation (city and national) and something can be done through the Land Management Plans.

Technical differences on what is meant by city and what it entails because they do not have these tools in the entire country. Approach is interesting to see how they improve aspects and indicators from every city, are not major cities or major cities, go beyond the exercise of comparing and challenged by the dynamics of the country.

2. Jorge Hernán Cárdenas

Begins its participation worthwhile mentioning against the origin question is this study. Quipo comes from a private university in California where favorable economic conditions allow them and invite them to think this sort of thing. Brings up previous publications and mentions that his second publication was facing the nation must learn metropolitan areas.

Similarly Cities Network *Cómo Vamos*, is promoting intersectoral discussions that invite dialogue between the district, city and country. Also they observed not only the indicators but perceptions of citizenship. Then the Rockefeller Foundation study and find a vehicle for implementation and study quite relevant country.

It is an extremely important project that should be made visible and calls to consider the five dimensions have been proposed equity participation of different levels and active growth that will improve conditions for all, sustainability is necessary to give and take into account factors such as health and the environment. Finally, stability in terms of confidence in the state as a necessary condition for improving cities.

However, it is worth noting and draws attention to the uniqueness of Colombia:

- The condition of forced displacement due to the armed conflict, show that many people are forced to move to cities to look for opportunities. They have intensified the process of moving to the cities in Colombia dynamics concentration of population in cities and metropolitan areas is emphasized.

For example, Quibdó is a city happened to have 60,000 to have about 140,000 which implies a rapid growth of cities that hinders the response of local governments in the proportion of welfare conditions, services and control aspects such as mobility. In

addition, displacement victims located in extreme vulnerability in all aspects, housing, labor market, services, health, etc.

- Social participation of people can not only focus on market dynamics but also in making policy decisions and city models. Therefore, it should encourage participation and social empowerment that improve the relationship between the state, the market and citizens for better planning and implementation of public policies. For local government transparency, participation and clarity are essential.
- The challenge is to translate economic growth into inclusive processes, economic concentration is very pronounced. (10% rich is 37 times what the poorest 10%). Inequality is very pronounced in the country, therefore, sustainable and inclusive growth is a challenge.
- The difference between men and women is extremely important.
- The project is welcome, is based on an experience of US metropolitan areas, which can be expanded in different parts of the world and brings an approach and an invitation to get good data and generate good conversations. The task is in governments, businesses (media) and citizens in the exercise of their rights.
- Alliances that go beyond the government as How We transcend temporality of a government of 4 years and are responsible for making a call in maintaining the processes of economic development in an inclusive manner. then transforming cities in a relevant, innovative and accurately informed manner.

3. Manuel Pastor

Invites all attendees to get up and look for a person who do not know to discuss two points.

1. What do you call the attention of the presentation of the study?
2. What are the gaps inclusive economy in Colombia and the things that can be said to improve the process?

Questions from the audience

- Jesus Zambrano Mario Miranda - Cúcuta How are we
Forced displacement is an important element because cities are the vulnerable people (national and Venezuela). However, there are two types of displaced persons, who are passing and those who come and seek subsist within cities (those are passing as pay and those who do not stay there). This has an impact on the economies (deterioration of employment informality and unemployment oversupply, replacing labor) and the cultural and social conditions of the city. It should also be noted that urban mobility and mobility within the city is an important aspect to analyze, taking into account the segregation that may involve the lack of access roads and illegal dynamic transport to the city (pirate taxi).
- Oscar Robles - Ministry of Environment
Front indicator of water quality, says that is important because it aims since their inception, transcending district governments and call public policy measure and

straighten its course, in this case, to urban rivers and leading to a battery basic sanitation to improve living conditions of the population and improve this resource.

Mentions the Environmental Modeling Center of the city as a place where information is consolidated city to build indicators guiding public policy to improve the quality of life in the city (under construction). Also it brings to discussion the importance of indicators that are understandable to the public (communities).

- Claudia Andrea Ramírez - Secretary of Planning

It mentions that exercise is very important because it is closely connected with the work they do from the Ministry of Planning, while what is being searched now within projects is to make more holistic and comprehensive measurements of indicators. As a contribution, there would be thought a territorial approach and the impact that the elements that concern you have in the quality of life also stands out in the exercise not only the measurement data but reading the vision of the population against data aspects study (Public perception Survey).

Close suggesting that should complement the studies of cities with the rural part of them and the regions in which they are immersed.

- Enrique Bayer - Universidad de la Sabana

It states that Sabana Centro Cómo Vamos handles the savannah of Bogota look beyond the city justifies it with this kind of partnerships that local governments and their temporality beyond 4 years. To be the region's participation Bogotá Cómo Vamos given and other strategic actors seek to include municipalities in measuring aspects that are strategic to improving the quality of life and cities.

Recommends exercises should seek cooperation of knowledge in which share our experiences to bring the issue to the metropolitan area.

- Piedad Restrepo - Medellin How Come

He mentions that there are more than 30 organizations working on issues of sustainable and inclusive development, however What is the added value of this study?

One of the most innovative aspects of the study is intergenerational mobility which invites you to create or structuring these indicators in Colombia.

A: //

He responds Manuel Pastor Universidad de los Andes are attempting through a longitudinal study monitoring and, technically argues that it can structure an idea of the data collected each year to give continuity to the studies trying to harmonize them.

also mentions that equity is an extremely important aspect and draft analysis of the data must go beyond measure and should theorize on the way out should bring these processes to this, it has tried to build a dialogue epistemic that nurtures.

- Jaime Torres District Overseer

On the theoretical framework of inclusive development, recommended a document of the OECD (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development) to Colombia on

Inclusive Development also mentions that CECODE (Colombian Business Council for Sustainable Development) has a business proposition.

Then it is important to mention placed in the context of the country and mentioned experiences System Including DNP Cities and MISC.

1. Included system Cities DNP is an interesting proposal in terms of crowds. It mentioned that the metropolis are not comparable, unless the United States with those of others, then it is important then see the national experiences of how cities are grouped.
2. MISC is a project that tries to connect what is meant by "header" and "rest" that comes from the rural DNP mission that seeks to establish a connection is understood how the country.

Faced with the technical data mentioned that the oversight is taking technical notes regarding killings, tourism and civic culture in a year in which Bogotá compared to other cities.

The challenge is how to be compared and what is comparable. To land the theoretical bet should be the development plans of cities as input and finally, it is questionable in terms of post-conflict including how it is conceived from the cities and the nation.

- Fredy Olaya - Delegate Veedor

Notes that it is important to see the traceability of indicators and understand the correlation between them. Closed by an invitation to review the initiatives of the public sector.

- Monica Villegas - Corona Foundation

It raises the question in front of that being such a technical issue how you can build conceptual frameworks hand with communities to impact more significantly and promote better appropriation. Because the dynamics is given so that the community reports and experts measure, how you can make this process successfully.

A: // Manuel Pastor Responds to the US experience has shown that community organizations are a little more sophisticated and processes have perhaps satisfactorily. It is important to start basic issues at the community level and see this as part of the process and not as an intervention and longer.

Should talk to the community about how he understands every aspect to be measured and then return to feed back what was learned from the exercise, the attitude should be humble and be open to learning.

You are asked a person from the community to present the data in the community at the end of the exercises, this to empower them, force us to explain them and invite them to understand what was evident in the data.

- Jorge Hernán Cárdenas

The importance of the role of communities of knowledge and building good narratives are two important aspects that are aspects that affect public policy change.

- Manuel Pastor
Colombia is a very unique country, comparing data between countries is very important and mobility over time is very important through longitudinal studies.
Appreciates the attention paid to gender issues and mentions that if it should take into account the migration of people in terms of will or obligation. Cómo Vamos groups in other countries would be very useful because it is the only way to help close the gap and transcend temporality of governments.
also mentioned that the inclusion narrative is extremely important because it influences politics and can invite her to change conditions, the importance of the knowledge communities is to draw attention of community leaders and community leaders.

Workshop

a brief contextualization of initial presentation is mentioned and some initial observations of the Colombian case.

Preliminary results from Colombia

An economy is equitable as there are more opportunities are available to allow upward mobility for more people. All segments of society, especially the poor and socially disadvantaged groups, can take advantage of these opportunities.

Inequality is declining rather than increasing. People have equal access to a stronger economic base, including equal access to goods and services and adequate infrastructure, such as public transport, education, clean air and water.

Add the following comments:

- Front indicator net enrollment rate in preschool, you can see that the results are very different city. Medellin and Bogota stand out, but the changes are not significant in years.
- GINI coefficient evidence that inequality is high and does not change over time.
- The maternal mortality rate is understood in terms of gender equity in access to health. It is evident that, even in cities like Cali positive results are not seen an overall improvement.
- Abuses against women (killings, domestic violence and sexual violence) but decreases over time in Bogota, is seen to be a broad indicator in the cities.
- a subjective indicator, perspective on the kind of respect there for women is addressed. It is shown that respect is very low in some cities and one in Medellin is a positive result.
- The overall participation rate of women is lower compared with men
- Mortality rate of children under 1 year
- Daily passenger mass transit

instruction is given to each table that you have a portfolio with indicators and the invitation is to be discussed whether these are good or not and whether they are relevant. In addition, they are invited to ponder over the three key points discussed at the conference:

1. If really it is building knowledge communities and how you can promote
2. If you really are promoting a narrative city, which has impact
3. There is enough community participation in the construction of indicators and how they can improve these actions in order to transcend consultation and can build together.

Results.

Table 1.

The representative mentioned that reviewed the growing dimension, inquired about the indicators that have indicators and considered as "the good work and job opportunity." He mentions that came the discussion about what is decent employment and variation in per capita income also talked about the Integrated Household Survey and how this is done is not metropolitan areas city.

In front of the family welfare thought of elements such as nutrition, health and housing. Labor income and quantitative housing deficit could complement and coverage of public services and unmet basic needs.

Faced with questions, they related the 1 with 3 mentions that understand that is to involve the community and the key player would be the Community Action Boards in Cali and Medellin and Bogota Local Boards. But they mention that we do not know how are these indicated to bridge community also identified that are not creating a narrative city.

Table 2.

sustainability

To suggest precise definition to find what does the environment to health. Questioning against the indicators, did not fit them much the idea of health in the analysis. Among the indicators there are very important as the social and economic well-being, such as PM10 and PM2.5 indicators because these are the ones who can show that health is affected.

Versus consumption and water quality, warn that it is important to expand in some cities the different water bodies monitoring consumption. Also important to see the management and use of wastewater.

Identify the importance of tree planting to see how the offer to the public, for example, watching indicators such as the "reason of trees per capita" and also mention that should be taken into account food waste.

Faced with supplementary questions consents say no way knowledge communities are created, but how we have a limited scope. Its mission is not geared towards this aspect, but

that are other organizations, academics and communities. They mentioned that currently do perhaps without intending

Seen as a challenge to articulate the roles to do all the same and each actor do what you can. Also they emphasize that technicians sometimes use terms that may be derogatory to the community.

See opportunity in youth are those who opt knowledge with their communities. Also mention that there is a great discredit to the research community is very skeptical data, credibility technical information is a barrier.

For example, civic awards. Social organizations and establishes mapped dialogues and joint causes.

Table 3.

Equity

In reviewing preschool coverage would be more appropriate measure coverage in early childhood education. Also in education indicators suggest consider as "knowledge test performance depending on grade level parent".

They also make an observation against the data provided as a percentage of students who have excelled in performance and socioeconomic status does not understand corresponding percentage is given.

Faced with public transport is not understood mention the percentage referred to equalize suggest considering cities in Cali if Bean number of passengers daily.

Mentioned to be included square meters of public space per inhabitant, compared to gender equality and relative poverty, do not know if you can measure quality of employment, then suggest to analyze differences in wages, occupations, etc.

Faced with the questions mentioned that universities should be those established contact and replicate experiences. In the case of Bogotá, advisory councils have helped establish that contact.

Table 4.

Equity

Mentioned coverage compared to net preschool they agree with the previous group but mention that it is important to monitor and see secondary education and higher education. Beyond superior must be what happens with professionals in terms of work.

Mentioned as a key check formality and informality appearance. Also bring up the racial approach, managers in public institutions are not races that dominate the territory and that is something worth watching.

They also emphasize that it is important to measure coverage and quality of education, comparative purchasing power against other countries, household income by socioeconomic status, maternal mortality should be disaggregated by socioeconomic and adolescent pregnancy also.

Faced with questions consider themselves knowledge communities are created, but not named in this way. more discussions on growth than on inclusivity have. Technology is an opportunity for inclusion, but it represents a challenge. However, they mention that there are things that should be participatory and others do not.

Mesa 5.

Equity

Facing upward mobility, they addressed the question referred with children's opportunity in order to see those involved. They raise the question of how one could approach intergenerational mobility (if possible by age groups).

On inequality - GINI mention that costs them pigeonhole into one of the categories they consider to be a Convention supplemented indicator.

Likewise they raise incomes who do not know are important to study, work, transfers, etc.

Against gender equality, they suggest that gender should say and draw attention against the indicator of respect may mask practices of discrimination and exclusion, so would include other dimensions of equity such as political participation.

Faced with the question mentioned that the information communities are different knowledge communities therefore worth seeing what role these in terms of innovation.

Closing

Monica appreciates the presence of technicians How Come for their willingness and participation, in addition to Manuel and researchers to share their ideas and projects to implement the task of landing the subject.

"A real conversation and where there is genuine debate and differences, now that we know that you have read us and made observations. We know there are things we must do, we hope we also have planted an idea and a focus of discussion for you. " Manuel Pastor